

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS MACHINES CORPORATION

Petitioner

v.

SECURITY FIRST INNOVATIONS, LLC

Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2025-01201

U.S. Patent No. 8,904,194

PETITIONER'S UNOPPOSED MOTION TO SEAL PETITIONER'S
SUR-REPLY IN OPPOSITION TO PATENT OWNER'S
REQUEST FOR DISCRETIONARY DENIAL

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. MOTION TO SEAL1

 A. DOCUMENTS TO BE SEALED1

 1. Petitioner’s Sur-reply1

 B. GOOD CAUSE EXISTS FOR SEALING IDENTIFIED
 DOCUMENTS2

 C. NON-CONFIDENTIAL VERSIONS OF CONFIDENTIAL
 DOCUMENTS2

 D. CERTIFICATION OF NON-PUBLICATION.....2

III. CONCLUSION.....3

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

<u>Rules</u>	Page(s)
37 C.F.R. § 42.14.....	1
37 C.F.R. § 42.54.....	1, 2

PETITIONER’S TABLE OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,904,194 (“’194 Patent”)
1002	Declaration of Dr. Erez Zadok
1003	PCT Patent Application Publication No. 01/022322 (“Dickinson”)
1004	U.S. Patent No. 6,363,481 (“Hardjono”)
1005	Claudia Canali <i>et al.</i> , <i>Performance Comparison of Distributed Architectures for Content Adaptation and Delivery of Web Resources</i> , 25 IEEE Int’l Conf. on Distributed Comput. Sys. Workshops 331 (2005) (“Canali”)
1006	File History of U.S. Patent No. 8,904,194 (“’194 File History”)
1007	File History of U.S. Patent Application Serial No. 11/258,839 (“’839 App. File History”)
1008	Reserved
1009	U.S. Provisional Application Serial No. 60/622,146 (“Provisional Application No. 60/622,146”)
1010	U.S. Provisional Application Serial No. 60/718,185 (“Provisional Application No. 60/718,185”)
1011	Microsoft Computer Dictionary
1012	Bruce Schneier, <i>Applied Cryptography</i> , 2nd ed., 1996, excerpts (“Schneier”)
1013	Highlighted Comparison Between Dickinson and the ’194 Patent
1014	Yitzhak Birk, “Random RAIDs with Selective Exploitation of Redundancy for High Performance Video Servers,” IEEE 1997 (“Birk”)
1015	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2003/0016596A1 (“Chiquoine”)
1016	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Erez Zadok
1017	John Kubiatoiwicz, et al., “OceanStore: An Architecture for Global-Scale Persistent Storage,” ACM 2000 (“Kubiatoiwicz”)
1018	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2001/0034795 (“Moulton”)
1019	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2003/0046551 (“Brennan”)
1020	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2002/0049655 (“Bennet”)

Exhibit No.	Description
1021	<i>Google, LLC v. Sec. First Innovations, LLC</i> , IPR2024-00212, Exhibit 1043 (Patent Owner’s Proposed Claim Constructions In <i>Sec. First Innovations, LLC v. Google, LLC</i> , No. 2:23-cv-00097 (E.D. Va.)) (“PO’s Google Litigation Construction”)
1022	<i>Sotera</i> Stipulation
1023	Cisco and IBM Joint Press Release, “Cisco and IBM Work Together to Accelerate the ASP Ecosystem” (Oct. 18, 1999)
1024	TechMonitor Article, “IBM Announces Software Consulting Initiative for ASPs” (Oct. 26, 1999)
1025	Press Release, <i>Emerging ASP Market Standardizing on Citrix Platform</i> (epixtech, inc., Jan. 19, 2000)
1026	Spencer E. Ante, “IBM Sells the Next Big Thing in E-Business,” <i>BusinessWeek</i> (Nov. 5, 2002)
1027	“Study: IBM and EDS Lead Web Hosting Market,” <i>Computerworld</i> (May 30, 2003)
1028	2014 Statement of Work (PROTECTIVE ORDER MATERIAL)
1029	2017 Statement of Work (PROTECTIVE ORDER MATERIAL)
1030	U.S. Patent No. 9,338,140 (“the ’140 Patent”)
1031	U.S. Patent No. 10,452,854 (“the ’854 Patent”)
1032	U.S. Patent No. 11,068,609 (“the ’609 Patent”)
1033	U.S. Patent No. 11,178,116 (“the ’116 Patent”)
1034	Declaration of Pankaj Parekh in Support of Approval of Disclosure Statement and Confirmation of Plan of Reorganization, <i>In re Sec. First Corp.</i> , No. 20-12053 (BLS) (Bankr. D. Del. Oct. 13, 2020)
1035	<i>Sec. First Innovations, LLC v. Google LLC</i> , No. 2:23-cv-97 (E.D. Va.), Dkt. 1.
1036	USPTO Order Granting Ex Parte Reexamination of U.S. Patent No. 9,338,140 (Control No. 90/019,836)
1037	<i>Google LLC v. Sec. First Innovations, LLC</i> , IPR2024-00215, Paper 43 (PTAB May 16, 2025) (Final Written Decision)
1038	<i>Google LLC v. Sec. First Innovations, LLC</i> , IPR2024-00214, Paper 44 (PTAB May 16, 2025) (Final Written Decision)
1039	<i>Google LLC v. Sec. First Innovations, LLC</i> , IPR2024-00212, Paper 42 (PTAB May 16, 2025) (Final Written Decision)

Exhibit No.	Description
1040	Docket Navigator Report – List of Cases Involving the '194 Patent
1041	<i>Sec. First Innovations, LLC v. Google LLC</i> , No. 2:23-cv-97 (E.D. Va.), Dkt. 254-1
1042	<i>Sec. First Innovations, LLC v. IBM</i> , No. 1:25-cv-00514-CMH-WEF (E.D. Va.), Dkt. 88 (Aug. 20, 2025)
1043	Comparison Of Specification In PCT Patent Application Publication No. 01/022322 (EX1003) And U.S. Patent No. 7,187,771 (EX2030)
1044	Declaration of Mr. Michael Loria (“Loria Decl.”)

I. INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.14 and 42.54, Petitioner International Business Machines Corporation (“IBM”) hereby respectfully moves to seal Petitioner’s Sur-reply in Opposition to Patent Owner’s Request for Discretionary Denial (“Sur-reply”) filed concurrently herewith, designated as PROTECTIVE ORDER MATERIAL pursuant to the Default Protective Order¹. Patent Owner does not oppose.

II. MOTION TO SEAL

A. DOCUMENTS TO BE SEALED

1. Petitioner’s Sur-reply

IBM’s Sur-reply refers to and quotes confidential information in Exhibit 2021 designated PROTECTIVE ORDER MATERIAL by SFI and is currently subject to a motion to seal (*see* Paper 12). IBM submits a public, redacted version of the Sur-reply that redacts only those passages that would disclose confidential terms from Exhibit 2021.

¹ Patent Owner filed an unopposed motion for entry of the Default Protective Order on October 6, 2025, which is pending. *See* Paper 13.

B. GOOD CAUSE EXISTS FOR SEALING IDENTIFIED DOCUMENTS

IBM's Sur-reply quotes and characterizes information in Exhibit 2021 that Patent Owner, SFI, has designated PROTECTIVE ORDER MATERIAL and has moved to seal. *See* Paper 12. According to SFI, there is good cause to seal Exhibit 2021. Paper 12 at 2-3. For those same reasons, IBM seeks to seal the portions of IBM's Sur-reply that quote and/or characterize Exhibit 2021. IBM is filing a public redacted version of the Sur-reply that redacts the portions that quote and/or characterize information in Exhibit 2021.

C. NON-CONFIDENTIAL VERSIONS OF CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENTS

Pursuant to Section 5(A)(ii) of the Default Protective Order, IBM hereby files a public redacted version of the Petitioner's Sur-reply that redact any PROTECTIVE ORDER MATERIAL.

D. CERTIFICATION OF NON-PUBLICATION

The undersigned counsel certifies that information sought to be sealed by this Motion have not, to their knowledge, been published or otherwise made public. Also, pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.54, IBM has in good faith conferred with other affected parties in an effort to resolve any dispute on the motion to seal.

III. CONCLUSION

For the reasons discussed above, IBM respectfully requests that the Board grant its motion to seal Petitioner's Sur-reply.

Dated: October 30, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

/Taeg Sang Cho/
Taeg Sang Cho (Reg. No. 69,618)

Desmarais LLP

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that on October 30, 2025, complete copies of the foregoing was served on counsel of record for the Patent Owner by filing the documents through P-TACTS and by sending via electronic mail to the following addresses:

Stephen J. Elliott, Lead Counsel
USPTO Reg. No. 52,858
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
125 Broad St., New York, NY 10004
Telephone: (212) 558-7446
Facsimile: (212) 291-9868
Email: elliotts@sullcrom.com

Kenneth J. Weatherwax,
USPTO Reg. No. 54,528
LOWENSTEIN & WEATHERWAX
LLP
1016 Pico Blvd, Santa Monica,
CA 90405
Telephone: (310) 307-4503
Email:
weatherwax@lowensteinweatherwax.com

Nathan Lowenstein, *Pro hac vice*
LOWENSTEIN & WEATHERWAX LLP
1016 Pico Blvd., Santa Monica, CA 90405
Telephone: (310) 307-4502
Facsimile: (310) 307-4509
Email: lowenstein@lowensteinweatherwax.com

Colette Woo, *Pro hac vice*
LOWENSTEIN & WEATHERWAX
LLP
1016 Pico Blvd., Santa Monica, CA
90405
Telephone: (310) 307-4511
Facsimile: (310) 307-4509
Email:
woo@lowensteinweatherwax.com

Dennis J. Courtney, *Pro hac vice*
LOWENSTEIN & WEATHERWAX LLP
1016 Pico Blvd., Santa Monica, CA 90405
Telephone: (310) 307-4521
Facsimile: (310) 307-4509
Email:
courtney@lowensteinweatherwax.com

Andrei Iancu (Reg. No. 41,862)
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
1888 Century Park East, Los Angeles,
CA 90067-1725
Telephone: 310-712-6600
Facsimile: 310-712-8800
Email: iancua@sullcrom.com

Dustin F. Guzior, *Pro hac vice*
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
125 Broad St., New York, NY 10004
Telephone: (212) 558-7446
Facsimile: (212) 291-9868
Email: guziord@sullcrom.com

Haley M. Sanders, *Pro hac vice*
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
125 Broad St., New York, NY 10004
Telephone: (212) 558-7446
Facsimile: (212) 291-9868
Email: sandersh@sullcrom.com

Dated: October 30, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

/Taeg Sang Cho/
Taeg Sang Cho (Reg. No. 69,618)
tcho@desmaraisllp.com
DESMARAIS LLP

Counsel for Petitioner
International Business Machines Corporation