

Albright Worried Multipatent Trials Ask Too Much Of Jurors



By *Cara Salvatore*

Law360 (December 18, 2020, 5:39 PM EST) -- Texas federal Judge Alan Albright says he's so concerned about jurors getting lost in IP trials that he'd rather chop up cases with multiple patents into multiple trials.

Trials involving more than a very small number of patents ask too much of the jury in terms of understanding, the judge said Wednesday, speaking at a panel sponsored by [Magna Legal Services](#) and [Winston & Strawn LLP](#) on how to communicate with jurors.

"I don't think it's fair to have a jury trying to handle more than two or three patents at a time," Judge Albright said at the event.

"With every additional patent, their ability to follow along with the number of claims that might be involved, the number of different technologies that might be involved, that's going down," the judge said.

Joining Judge Albright on the panel were Winston & Strawn partner Tom Melsheimer and [Tensegrity Law Group LLP's Matthew Powers](#). Both agreed with the judge's assessment of overwhelmed juries.

Powers said jurors start to get lost if there are too many topics in focus, whether those topics are trial themes or patents.

In a trial with six or seven patents, "The people who try to hit all six or seven patents equally are losing the opportunity to control where the debate is," Powers said. He said trial lawyers should narrow down and focus on "hinge issues."

Judge Albright said he's presiding right now over a case with "seven or eight" patents, and the parties have made opposite requests about how to try the case. One side wants a single trial with all of the patents; the other has requested individual trials, one for each patent.

Judge Albright, who didn't identify the matter, said he'll go somewhere in the middle, with at least two and possibly three trials.

That number of patents is simply too much of a cognitive load in one trial "to expect a jury to fully understand," he said -- especially for a technical matter.

"I think if there is more than one patent, that also increases the likelihood that the jury will care as much, if not more, about the performance. Not the content -- the performance of the lawyers and the witnesses, and their visceral reaction to it," Judge Albright said.

Melsheimer agreed that patent trials can overwhelm jurors. And he pointed out that each patent isn't just one single informational item; it's a list of individual independent and dependent claims, each and every one of which has to be reviewed painstakingly with the jury at the start of the trial.

It gets harder with more patents, Melsheimer said. So in a trial with two patents: "Look, you're going to have to do that death march for all the claims of both patents. And if anyone's found a great way to do that, they're probably not on this seminar, because they're retired," he said.

Judge Albright isn't the first to be worried about too many patents stuffed into one trial. A California federal judge told parties in 2017 he was concerned about the [possibility of 10 or more patents](#) in one 16-hour trial, saying it would be overkill.

--Editing by Adam LoBella.

For a reprint of this article, please contact reprints@law360.com.

0 Comments

Commenting enabled only for paid accounts

Related Articles

[What Judges Want You To Know: Litigate Smarter](#)

[MVP: Winston & Strawn's Thomas Melsheimer](#)

[Mistrial Called In \\$86M Stent Patent Case Against Medtronic](#)

[Winston Nabs 2 IP Pros With Large Waco Docket](#)

[Roku Tells WDTX Patent Jury Its Tech's Web Access Is Key](#)

Useful Tools & Links

- [Add to Briefcase](#)
- [Save to PDF & Print](#)
- [Rights/Reprints](#)
- [Editorial Contacts](#)

Related Sections

- [Intellectual Property](#)
- [Technology](#)
- [Texas](#)
- [Trials](#)

Law Firms

- [Tensegrity Law](#)
- [Winston & Strawn](#)

Companies

- [Magna Legal Services LLC](#)

2025 Rising Stars

Law360 Names 2025's Top Attorneys Under 40

Law360 is pleased to announce the Rising Stars of 2025, our list of more than 150 attorneys under 40 whose legal accomplishments belie their age.

Top 10 trending in Intellectual Property

- Tracking The Copyright Fights Between Creators And AI Cos.
- 'Disappointed' Alsup Wants More Info On \$1.5B Anthropic Deal
- Ex-USPTO Leaders Bullish On AI's Potential For Office, Attys
- Morgan Lewis Brings On 3 More Knobbe Martens IP Attys
- How USPTO Examiner Memo Informs Software Patent Drafting
- Phillips 66 Faces Retrial After 'Improper' Infringement Theory
- Judge Axes Machine Learning Railyard Patents Under Alice
- 9th Circ. Axes Ruling Trader Joe's 'Weaponized Legal System'
- Fish & Richardson Names Standard Essential Patents Leaders
- WIPO Leader Sees 'Clouds On The Horizon' For IP In US

Here's What You Missed

 [Quinn Emanuel Fights DQ Bid In Trade Secrets Fight](#)

[3rd Circ. Told Cigna's 'Private Label' Stelara May Alter Market](#)

 [Meta Wins At PTAB Amid IP Suit Over Facebook Safety Check](#)

[Texas Powerhouse: Norton Rose](#)

[Demystifying The Civil Procedure Rules Amendment Process](#)

[Lutnick Picks Ex-DOJ, TM Leaders To Advise USPTO](#)

[Senate Confirms Florida And Missouri Judges](#)

[4 Possible Factors In Nadine Menendez's Bribery Sentence](#)

 [NASA Shuts Down Black Ex-Engineer's Bias Suit](#)

 [Court Urged To Deny Bid To Block Captive Reporting Rules](#)

 [Coinbase Vendor Called 'Major' Cog In 'Insider Bribery' MDL](#)

[1st Circ. Urged To Nix \\$42M Disgorgement In Stock Scheme](#)

 [Ex-Copyright Chief Wants Firing Declared Invalid](#)

 [PTAB Leader Urges Specificity In Discretionary Denial Briefs](#)

 [Fed. Circ. Revives Realtek's Fee Bid In Semiconductor IP Feud](#)

 [CenterPoint Inks Deal To End Workers' 401\(k\) Fee Suit](#)

 [2nd Circ. Won't Nix Vimeo IP Loss But Clears Path For Appeal](#)

[Uber Jury Won't Hear Exec's Convo He 'Trashed Rape Victims'](#)

[Investor Tells Texas Justices UDF Claims Aren't Derivative](#)

 [CVS Says Takeda Tried To Block Heartburn Drug Competition](#)