

Albright Worried Multipatent Trials Ask Too Much Of Jurors



By [Cara Salvatore](#)

Law360 (December 18, 2020, 5:39 PM EST) -- Texas federal Judge Alan Albright says he's so concerned about jurors getting lost in IP trials that he'd rather chop up cases with multiple patents into multiple trials.

Trials involving more than a very small number of patents ask too much of the jury in terms of understanding, the judge said Wednesday, speaking at a panel sponsored by [Magna Legal Services](#) and [Winston & Strawn LLP](#) on how to communicate with jurors.

"I don't think it's fair to have a jury trying to handle more than two or three patents at a time," Judge Albright said at the event.

"With every additional patent, their ability to follow along with the number of claims that might be involved, the number of different technologies that might be involved, that's going down," the judge said.

Joining Judge Albright on the panel were Winston & Strawn partner Tom Melsheimer and [Tensegrity Law Group LLP's Matthew Powers](#). Both agreed with the judge's assessment of overwhelmed juries.

Powers said jurors start to get lost if there are too many topics in focus, whether those topics are trial themes or patents.

In a trial with six or seven patents, "The people who try to hit all six or seven patents equally are losing the opportunity to control where the debate is," Powers said. He said trial lawyers should narrow down and focus on "hinge issues."

Judge Albright said he's presiding right now over a case with "seven or eight" patents, and the parties have made opposite requests about how to try the case. One side wants a single trial with all of the patents; the other has requested individual trials, one for each patent.

Judge Albright, who didn't identify the matter, said he'll go somewhere in the middle, with at least two and possibly three trials.

That number of patents is simply too much of a cognitive load in one trial "to expect a jury to fully understand," he said — especially for a technical matter.

"I think if there is more than one patent, that also increases the likelihood that the jury will care as much, if not more, about the performance. Not the content — the performance of the lawyers and the witnesses, and their visceral reaction to it," Judge Albright said.

Melsheimer agreed that patent trials can overwhelm jurors. And he pointed out that each patent isn't just one single informational item; it's a list of individual independent and dependent claims, each and every one of which has to be reviewed painstakingly with the jury at the start of the trial.

It gets harder with more patents, Melsheimer said. So in a trial with two patents: "Look, you're going to have to do that death march for all the claims of both patents. And if anyone's found a great way to do that, they're probably not on this seminar, because they're retired," he said.

Judge Albright isn't the first to be worried about too many patents stuffed into one trial. A California federal judge told parties in 2017 he was concerned about the [possibility of 10 or more patents](#) in one 16-hour trial, saying it would be overkill.

--Editing by Adam LoBella.

For a reprint of this article, please contact reprints@law360.com.



0 Comments

Commenting enabled only for paid accounts

Useful Tools & Links

-  [Add to Briefcase](#)
-  [Save to PDF & Print](#)
-  [Rights/Reprints](#)
-  [Editorial Contacts](#)

Related Sections

- [Intellectual Property](#) 
- [Technology](#) 
- [Texas](#) 
- [Trials](#) 

Law Firms

- [Tensegrity Law](#) 
- [Winston & Strawn](#) 

Companies

- [Magna Legal Services LLC](#) 



Law360 Names 2025's Top Attorneys Under 40

Law360 is pleased to announce the Rising Stars of 2025, our list of more than 150 attorneys under 40 whose legal accomplishments belie their age.

Top 10 trending in Intellectual Property

- 1 [DC Circ. Temporarily Reinstates Copyright Head After Firing](#)
- 2 [Meet The Attys Now Fighting Judge Newman's Suspension](#)
- 3 [Patent Claim Lessons From Fed. Circ.'s Teva Decision](#)
- 4 [Fed. Circ. Won't Revisit Double-Patenting, Soda TM Appeals](#)
- 5 [Broadcom Urges Fed. Circ. To Undo Netflix's Patent Wins](#)
- 6 [Disney Says Forged Doc Aids \\$532K 'Moana' Sanctions Bid](#)
- 7 [Britannica, Merriam-Webster Sue Perplexity Over Content Use](#)
- 8 [Plaintiffs Seek Info From Microsoft, OpenAI In Copyright MDL](#)
- 9 [Tech M&A Pro Joins Baker McKenzie In Silicon Valley](#)
- 10 [Sonos Seeks Exit In \\$3M Royalties Suit By SoundExchange](#)

Related Articles

[What Judges Want You To Know: Litigate Smarter](#)

[MVP: Winston & Strawn's Thomas Melsheimer](#)

[Judges Warn Attys Not To Waste Jurors' Time In Patent Trials](#)

[Mistrial Called In \\$86M Stent Patent Case Against Medtronic](#)

[Winston Nabs 2 IP Pros With Large Waco Docket](#)

Here's What You Missed

[Nadine Menendez Gets 4½ Years In Bribery Case](#)

[Atty Accused Of Cyberstalking Law Firm Partner, Another Atty](#)

[Mistrial Declared For Execs Accused Of Bribing Navy Admiral](#)

[JCPenney Settles Fee Dispute Over Jackson Walker Romance](#)

[Influencer Vows To Revive Malpractice Case Against Akin](#)

[Sudanese 'Can't Prove' BNP Bankrolled Dictator, Jury Told](#)

[Fed. Circ. Keeps Google, Amazon Patent Fights In Calif.](#)

[Being A Professional Wrestler Makes Me A Better Lawyer](#)

[Berkshire Co. Says Insurers Owe \\$22M For Antitrust Judgment](#)

[Luminar Must Face Investor Suit Over Image Rip-Off Claims](#)

[IYO Loses Sanctions Bid In OpenAI Trademark Case](#)

[Lin Wood Can't Shake Trial Win For Ex-Partners](#)

[Trump Taps American Airlines Pilot For NTSB](#)

[5th Circ. Won't Revisit Doctor's Captive Insurance Case](#)

[Fed. Circ. Lets Ruling On Canada's Cherry Patent Stand](#)

[Zeiss Secures \\$785K In X-Ray Patent Trial Against Sigray](#)

[7th Circ. Backs \\$183M FCA Award Over Eli Lilly Drug Rebates](#)

[Vet's Wells Fargo Credit Ding Didn't Break Law, Jury Finds](#)

[Under Armour Prevails In PTAB Challenges To 4 Shoe Patents](#)

[Roblox, Discord Again Accused Of Ignoring Teen Exploitation](#)